

[Review Form2](#)

Book Name:	<a href="#">Current Progress in Arts and Social Studies Research</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_BPR_2579
Title of the Manuscript:	The value of traditional African religious music into liturgy: Lobethal Congregation
Type of the Article	Book chapter

**PART 1: Review Comments**

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p><b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b></p>	<p>I appreciate the manuscript's valuable interdisciplinary analysis of the incorporation of traditional African religious music into Christian liturgy, emphasising its capacity to enrich worship and engagement. The chosen title aptly conveys the essential elements of the study and is more succinct than the original proposal. Nevertheless, conducting a thorough analysis of more potent keywords could significantly amplify its influence and draw a more focused readership.</p>	
<p><b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b></p>	<p>The original title lacks clarity regarding the specific sort of liturgy. The phrase "into liturgy" is syntactically inelegant, and the title fails to adequately capture the breadth and importance of the research, which investigates both the assimilation of African music into Christian worship and its impact on engagement and cultural pertinence.</p> <p>The suggested title: "Traditional African Music in Evangelical Lutheran Liturgy: Enhancing Worship and Participation at Lobethal Congregation".</p> <p>This chosen title aptly conveys the essential elements of the study and is more succinct than the original proposal. Nevertheless, conducting a thorough analysis of more potent keywords could significantly amplify its influence and draw a more focused readership.</p>	

[Review Form2](#)

<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p><b>Lack of Theoretical Context:</b> The abstract lacks any reference to the theoretical framework or the wider scholarly context. Incorporating a concise explanation of the theoretical foundation, such as the need of cultural contextualisation in religious rituals, would enhance the framing of the study's significance.</p> <p><b>Broader Implications:</b> The abstract might be enhanced by including a couple of sentences that discuss the larger ramifications of the study's findings for other religious groups or the broader scholarly community. How could these findings impact future liturgical practices or add to the fields of religious studies and ethnomusicology?</p> <p><b>Clarification of Results:</b> The described discoveries, such as handclapping serving as a metronome, provide some level of detail but may benefit from improved integration to elucidate the significance of these findings. Rather of fixating on little particulars, it would be beneficial to provide a concise overview of how these alterations have affected the congregation's worship experience as a whole.</p> <p><b>Conclusions and Recommendations:</b> The abstract lacks clarity in presenting the study's conclusions or any explicit suggestions. To enhance the comprehensiveness of the abstract, it would be beneficial to include a succinct overview of the primary findings and a suggestion for additional study or practical application.</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>The manuscript's structure is suitable.</p>	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The work employs a mixed-methods approach that combines qualitative data from interviews, observations, and video recordings with quantitative attendance records, enhancing the validity and reliability of its conclusions. This comprehensive data collection allows for an in-depth examination of the impact of traditional African religious music on church involvement and commitment. Additionally, the study is grounded in a robust theoretical framework that leverages established literature and scholarly perspectives on music, mission, and contextualization. Overall, the methodology and theoretical foundation effectively support the study's objectives, offering valuable insights to the field.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. -</p>	<p>The manuscript's references exhibit a wide variety, encompassing theology, music, mission studies, and ethnomusicology. This vast range of sources enhances the research by providing both depth and breadth. Nevertheless, there are a couple of factors to take into account regarding their adequacy and timeliness:</p> <p><b>Sufficiency:</b> The paper incorporates a diverse range of references, demonstrating a deliberate attempt to establish the study within pertinent scholarly works. The text references numerous seminal works and researchers, including those that examine the significance of music in African spirituality and its incorporation into Christian liturgy.</p> <p>Although there are a sufficient number of references supporting the theological and ethnomusicological arguments, certain areas, such as empirical studies on the influence of music in religious settings, may benefit from more sources to strengthen the conclusions.</p> <p><b>Suggested references.</b></p> <p>Walter, Y., &amp; Altorfer, A. (2022). The psychological role of music and attentional control for religious experiences in worship. <i>Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology</i>, 75(12), 2272-2286.</p>	

[Review Form2](#)

	<p>Wald-Fuhrmann, M. (2024). 13. Music in Christian Services as a Means to Induce Religious Feelings. <i>MUSIC AND SPIRITUALITY</i>, 273.</p> <p>Walter, Y. (2021). Towards a Qualitative Model of Religious Worship Experiences: Perceived encounters with the divine in the ritual context of musical devotion practices. <i>American Journal of Qualitative Research</i>, 5(1), 94-141.</p> <p><b>Recency:</b> The references span a wide range of publication dates, with some important sources being rather ancient (e.g., Schrag 1989, Chernoff 1979, Friesen 1982). Although these fundamental books hold significance, the manuscript might be enhanced by incorporating more recent studies and theories from the last 10-15 years to accurately represent current trends and arguments in the area.</p> <p><b>Suggested references</b></p> <p>Colvin, G., &amp; Dewerse, R. (2022). Christian Mission and Indigenous Peoples.</p> <p>Said, S. (2021). White Pop, Shiny Armour and a Sling and Stone: Indigenous Expressions of Contemporary Congregational Song Exploring Christian-Māori Identity. <i>Religions</i>, 12(2), 123.</p> <p>Idamoyibo, A. A. (2016). Indigenous music in a new role. <i>Nordic Journal of African Studies</i>, 25(3&amp;4), 20-20.</p> <p>Apaah, F. (2018). <i>Lyrics of Songs and Poetry in Contemporary Indigenous Mission Theology: An Analysis of the Works of Six Ghanaians</i> (Doctoral dissertation, University Of Ghana).</p> <p><b>Recommendation:</b> In order to enhance the scientific rigour and relevance of the manuscript, it is recommended to incorporate more recent studies (published within the last ten years) that focus on similar topics. Specifically, studies that offer fresh perspectives on the incorporation of indigenous music in religious settings and contemporary approaches to mission work would be valuable additions. This would guarantee that the work is firmly based on current research and more attractive to a wider academic readership.</p>	
--	---	--

[Review Form2](#)

Minor REVISION comments

Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?

The manuscript effectively employs academic terminology and a formal writing style, demonstrating a strong command of English that is appropriate for the communication of complex ideas in scholarly disciplines such as theology, ethnomusicology, and cultural studies. However, few areas need to be strengthened. Some sentences and paragraphs are overly complex and could be simplified to improve readability. For example, the manuscript sometimes uses lengthy sentences with multiple clauses, which can obscure the main point. Breaking these into shorter, more direct sentences would help readers follow the argument more easily. Below are instances of sentences and paragraphs extracted from the work that are too convoluted and might be streamlined to enhance comprehensibility. To illustrate the improvement in clarity and conciseness, I will offer a modified version of each example.

**1. Original Sentence:**

- "It was demonstrated that church attendance increased dramatically after traditional African religious music was introduced into the Evangelical Lutheran liturgical services in 2011, and observations and video recordings showed that drums, rattles, horns, and whistles were used, with handclapping being seen to act almost as a metronome, which steadily maintained the tempo."

**Simplified Version:**

- "Church attendance increased significantly after the introduction of traditional African religious music into the Evangelical Lutheran liturgical services in 2011. Observations and video recordings showed the use of drums, rattles, horns, and whistles, with handclapping helping to maintain a steady tempo."

**2. Original Sentence:**

- "The study's results may have broader implications for other Evangelical Lutheran congregations in Africa and beyond, advocating for the integration of traditional music to enrich liturgical experiences, which is not only relevant in terms of enhancing church participation but also for fostering a deeper cultural and spiritual connection among congregants."

**Simplified Version:**

- "The study's findings suggest that integrating traditional music could enrich liturgical experiences for Evangelical Lutheran congregations in Africa and beyond. This approach may enhance church participation and foster a deeper cultural and spiritual connection among congregants."

**3. Original Paragraph:**

- "Observations and video recordings confirmed that drums, rattles, horns, and whistles were used, with song and movements being traditionally African; for example, handclapping played a prominent role. An interesting observation on the vital, if not central, role of handclapping observed in liturgical church services should be mentioned. From this study, it appeared that handclapping helped to maintain the tempo as the Lobethal Congregation gradually and habitually slowed the tempo of hymns during the course of the performance. It was noticeable that when handclapping was incorporated, the tempo was regularised, thereby producing a metronome effect."

**Simplified Version:**

- "Observations and video recordings showed the use of traditional African elements like drums, rattles, horns, whistles, and handclapping. Handclapping, in particular, played a vital role in maintaining the tempo, especially when the congregation tended to slow down during hymns. Its incorporation helped regularize the tempo, creating a metronome effect."

[Review Form2](#)

	<p><b>4. Original Sentence:</b>          - "It is concluded that introducing traditional African religious music, whilst maintaining the Evangelical Lutheran liturgy, will increase member participation and attendance, and therefore it is suggested that other Evangelical Lutheran congregations in Africa (that are losing church members because of poor attendance) could potentially consider introducing traditional African religious music as part of their church services."</p> <p><b>Simplified Version:</b>          - "The study concludes that incorporating traditional African religious music into Evangelical Lutheran liturgy can increase participation and attendance. Other congregations in Africa facing similar challenges could consider this approach."</p> <p><b>5. Original Sentence:</b>          - "The study contributes to the notion that traditional African religious music has a positive impact on mission work in the South African context, and this knowledge may help us to understand the relevance of traditional African religious music in terms of mission and liturgy."</p> <p><b>Simplified Version:</b>          - "The study shows that traditional African religious music positively impacts mission work in South Africa, highlighting its relevance in mission and liturgy."</p> <p><b>Summary of Simplification Strategy:</b>          - <b>Break Long Sentences:</b> Divide long sentences into shorter ones to improve readability.          - <b>Remove Redundant Phrases:</b> Eliminate phrases that repeat the same idea or add unnecessary complexity.          - <b>Clarify Main Points:</b> Focus on the key message in each sentence or paragraph to make it easier for readers to understand.</p> <p>By simplifying these sentences and paragraphs, the manuscript will become clearer, more concise, and more accessible to readers.</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b>comments</p>	<p>To enhance the effect of the conclusion, it is advisable to reiterate the primary contributions of the study to the field and offer explicit suggestions for future research or practical implementation. Emphasising the wider ramifications of the discoveries for other religious communities or areas of research would enhance the depth and significance. The document offers a significant contribution to the comprehension of incorporating traditional African religious music into Christian liturgy and its influence on worship and participation. By making improvements to the theoretical foundation, organisation, and clarity, the study could provide even more value to the academic community.</p>	

**PART 2:**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b></p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

[Review Form2](#)

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Alfred Patrick Addaquay</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>University of Ghana, Ghana</b>