

BPI Review Form 070520

Book Name:	An Overview of Literature, Language and Education Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_BPR_1293
Title of the Manuscript:	The State of Guidance and Counselling Programmes in High Schools in Manicaland, Zimbabwe
Type of the Article	Book chapter

BPI Review Form 070520

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment(If agreed with the reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. Authors must write his/her feedback here)
Is the manuscript important for the scientific community? Please write a few sentences explaining your answer	Yes, the manuscript is important for the scientific community as it provides empirical evidence and insights into the challenges facing school guidance and counseling programs in Zimbabwean high schools. It addresses critical issues such as inadequate training of counselors, inconsistent program implementation, and lack of resources, which are crucial for improving educational practices and student outcomes in similar contexts worldwide.	
Is the title of the article suitable? Do you have any alternative Title in your mind?	The title "The State of Guidance and Counselling Programmes in High Schools in Manicaland, Zimbabwe" is both valid and well stated. Why? Clarity: The topic is clear and specific. Scope: The scope is manageable. Relevance: The topic is relevant and timely.	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? If your answer is No, please provide suggestions	Areas for Improvement: Clarity and Conciseness: While detailed, the abstract can be made more concise without losing essential information. Some sentences could be shortened for better readability. Results Presentation: The abstract mentions the use of frequency tables for data analysis, but it does not provide specific quantitative results or percentages, which could make the findings more concrete. Implications: While the abstract touches on several findings, it would benefit from a brief mention of the implications of these findings or recommendations for future actions or studies. Grammar and Flow: Some minor grammatical adjustments and rephrasing can enhance the readability and professionalism of the abstract.	
Do you think the English quality of the article is suitable for scholarly communications? If your answer is No, please provide suggestions	The English quality of the article appears to need improvement for scholarly communications. There are several grammatical errors, awkward sentence structures, and unclear phrasing throughout the text. Scholarly articles typically require clear, precise, and grammatically correct language to effectively communicate research findings and insights. Editing for clarity, coherence, and adherence to academic writing conventions would enhance the suitability of the article for scholarly communication.	
Please provide your comments regarding the appropriateness of different sections of the manuscript.	DETAILS The topic The topic "The State of Guidance and Counselling Programmes in High Schools in Manicaland, Zimbabwe" is both valid and well stated. Why? Clarity: The topic is clear and specific. Scope: The scope is manageable. Relevance: The topic is relevant and timely. Abstract The abstract provided is quite detailed and covers several important aspects of the study. However, there are areas for improvement to meet the standards of a good and publishable abstract: Areas for Improvement: Clarity and Conciseness: While detailed, the abstract can be made more concise without losing essential information. Some sentences could be shortened for better readability. Results Presentation: The abstract mentions the use of frequency tables for data analysis, but it does not provide specific quantitative results or percentages, which	

BPI Review Form 070520

	could make the findings more concrete. 7. Implications: While the abstract touches on several findings, it would benefit from a brief mention of the implications of these findings or recommendations for future actions or studies. 8. Grammar and Flow: Some minor grammatical adjustments and rephrasing can enhance the readability and professionalism of the abstract. Referncing of the Article/Chapter The reference provided is mostly correct according to APA format, but there are a few adjustments needed for accuracy. Here is the corrected version: Mapfumo, J., & Nkoma, E. (2013). The state of guidance and counselling programmes in high schools in Manicaland, Zimbabwe. <i>International Journal of Scientific Research in Education</i>, 6(2), 100-116. Retrieved from http://www.ij sre.com Introduction/Background The introduction is comprehensive and provides a detailed background on the importance and structure of guidance and counselling programmes. However, to ensure it meets the standards for academic writing, a few revisions can enhance clarity, coherence, and conciseness. Here's a revised version with improved structure and flow: Introduction/Background Guidance and counselling in schools have been conceptualized as programmes of activities that address the complex scientific, social, economic, and technological challenges faced by students (Okobiah&Okorodudu, 2004). These programmes offer services tailored to individuals' needs, influenced by their environments, and aim to help students understand themselves, their problems, their school environments, and the wider world, thus enabling them to make wise life choices (UNESCO, 2004). Experts agree that guidance and counselling comprise three major components: educational, vocational, and personal-social services (UNESCO, 2000). Milner (1970) and Tolbert (1978) note that 'guidance' and 'counselling' are distinct but complementary. Guidance encompasses services such as appraisal, information dissemination, placement, orientation, evaluation, referral, follow-up, and counselling (Denga, 2001). Counselling, a method within guidance, emphasizes one-on-one relationships where students discuss significant personal matters with counsellors (Milner, 1970). Effective school programmes should employ both information dissemination and personalized counselling (Gysbers et al., 2004; Schmidt, 1999). Evaluating guidance and counselling programmes has been part of professional dialogue since the 1920s (Gysbers, 2004). In developed countries like the United States, there is an increasing emphasis on accountability, requiring school counsellors to demonstrate their contributions to student development and success (ASCA, 2003; Lapan, 2001, 2005; Maliszewski & Mackiel, 2002). Research-based approaches have shown positive impacts on student achievement and behaviour (Brigman & Campbell, 2003; Jarvis & Keeley, 2003). Comprehensive guidance and counselling programmes, such as those in Zimbabwe, include curriculum, responsive services, and system support (Mapfumo, 2001; Gazzola &	
--	--	--

BPI Review Form 070520

	Samson, 2004). The curriculum covers career planning, self-knowledge, and educational development. Responsive services address students' personal and emotional needs through counselling and consultations. System support involves professional development for counsellors, community outreach, and the management of the programme (Gysbers & Henderson, 2006). This study evaluates the state of guidance and counselling programmes in high schools in Manicaland, Zimbabwe. It examines the qualifications and training of counsellors, their job descriptions, and the implementation effectiveness of these programmes. Effective programmes are expected to yield benefits such as improved academic achievement, reduced indiscipline, enhanced personal-social development, and better vocational preparedness (Boutwell & Myers, 1992; Lapan, Gysbers & Sun, 1997; Sink & Stroh, 2003). In summary, this study aims to provide a comprehensive evaluation of the guidance and counselling programmes in high schools in Manicaland, Zimbabwe, highlighting areas of strength and identifying opportunities for improvement to enhance student outcomes. Note: This revised introduction provides a strong foundation for the rest of the study, clearly setting out its context, purpose, and significance. Overall Assessment of the statement of the problem, goals of the study and research questions The components are appropriate and well-stated, with revisions to improve clarity and coherence. They provide a solid foundation for the study, ensuring that it is focused, relevant, and capable of addressing the identified problem comprehensively. Specifically: • Statement of the Problem: The statement is relevant, well-contextualized, and justifies the need for the study. The revision improves clarity and coherence. • Goals of the Study: The goals are clear, aligned with the problem statement, and significant for the field. • Research Questions: The questions are directly related to the study's goals, specific, researchable, and comprehensive. The revision ensures they are clearly stated and aligned with the study's objectives. Revision for Clarity: Goals This study aims to: 1. Assess the state of guidance and counselling programmes in high schools in terms of their content, management, and specific activities undertaken by guidance counsellors. 2. Evaluate the preparedness and qualifications of those responsible for implementing these programmes. Research Questions	
--	---	--

BPI Review Form 070520

	This study aims to answer the following questions: 1. Is there a formal guidance and counselling curriculum in high schools? 2. What is the content of the guidance and counselling programmes offered in these schools? 3. What system supports are available for guidance and counselling in schools that offer these services? 4. What is the level of preparedness and experience of guidance counsellors in high schools in Manicaland, Zimbabwe? Method Assessment Overall, the research instruments are adequate and relevant for the study's objectives. They cover essential aspects from multiple perspectives (counsellors, school heads, and students). With <u>improvements, especially to the student questionnaire</u>, they can provide a comprehensive understanding of the state of guidance and counselling programmes in high schools in Manicaland, Zimbabwe. Suggested Revision Research Instruments Three research instruments were used: in-depth interviews with guidance counsellors and school heads, and a questionnaire for students. In-depth interviews with guidance counsellors addressed issues such as their preparedness for leading the development and implementation of the guidance and counselling programme, programme content, activities, and documentation of guidance-related curricula and activities. These interviews also assessed the perceived impact of the programmes on student behaviour and performance, the extent of collaboration with other teachers and stakeholders, and programme evaluation methods. For the guidance counsellor interview schedule, see Appendix I. For the heads of schools, in-depth interviews gathered information on their role in the origin and management of the guidance and counselling programme, their perceptions of its benefits and disadvantages, their attitudes towards these programmes, and the resources allocated to support them. For the head of school interview schedule, see Appendix II. The student questionnaire, a seven-item instrument, assessed student awareness of the guidance and counselling programmes, the content received, and the relevance of the interventions to their needs. It also gathered information on students' specific counselling needs. To ensure comprehensive data collection, additional items could be included to explore detailed feedback on specific guidance sessions, perceived effectiveness, and suggestions for improvements. For the student questionnaire, see Appendix III. Assessment: Procedure The procedure is comprehensive and covers essential aspects of study initiation, permissions, respondent selection, and data collection. With minor additions for clarity and	
--	---	--

BPI Review Form 070520

	detail, it can provide a robust framework for conducting the research effectively. Suggested Improvements for Clarity and Detail • Details on Consent: Provide more specific information on how informed consent was obtained from students and any ethical considerations addressed. • Training of Assistants: Include details on the training provided to assistant researchers to ensure data collection reliability. • Interview Recording: Specify whether interviews were recorded (audio or video) for accuracy, in addition to making notes. • Data Analysis Plan: Briefly outline the plan for analyzing the collected data to give a comprehensive view of the procedure. Suggested Revised Text Procedure This study originated from the lead author's long-standing interest in assessing the state of guidance and counselling programmes in high schools. With several years dedicated to institutionalising these programmes in Zimbabwe, the lead author brought valuable experience to the research. Permission to conduct the study was obtained from the Provincial Office of the Ministry of Education, Sports, Arts and Culture. Following this, visits were made to selected high schools to liaise with the school heads, explain the research objectives, and request permission to carry out the study. The heads of schools facilitated connections with the guidance counsellors in their respective schools. Student respondents were selected with the assistance of school heads and guidance counsellors, who were informed about the number of student respondents needed for the study at each form level. To ensure ethical compliance, the necessary steps to obtain informed consent from students were taken before their participation. On the appointed days, the researchers visited each school in the morning. They were assisted by selected teachers to choose students for the questionnaire. Two researchers conducted the in-depth interviews concurrently: one interviewed the guidance counsellor, and the other interviewed the head of the school. The interviews were documented through detailed notes (or recorded, if applicable). Trained assistant researchers administered the student questionnaire in a common venue at each school, ensuring consistency in data collection. Presentation and Discussion of Results Overall Assessment: The results and discussion section is comprehensive, presenting data on the state of guidance and counselling programmes in high schools, the content of these programmes, system supports, and the preparedness of personnel involved. It effectively correlates the findings with previous studies, enhancing the reliability and relevance of the results. However, it can be made better by looking at the following:	
--	--	--

BPI Review Form 070520

	Areas for Improvement 1. Clarify and Expand on Data Presentation: • Tables mentioned (e.g., Table 1, Table 2, Table 3, Table 4, Table 5) should be clearly presented within the text or as appendices. Ensure all tables have appropriate titles and captions for clarity. • Provide more specific numerical data and statistical analysis where possible to support qualitative findings. 2. In-Depth Discussion: • The discussion should delve deeper into the implications of the findings. For instance, how does the lack of career guidance impact students' future prospects? • Address potential reasons for the discrepancies in the frequency of sessions reported by students. 3. Evaluation of Programme Effectiveness: • More detailed analysis on the outcomes of the guidance and counselling programmes is needed. For example, how do these programmes impact student behavior and academic performance? • Discuss how the findings align or diverge from the ASCA National Model and other international standards. 4. Recommendations Section: • The recommendations provided are relevant but should be more specific. For instance, what specific actions should universities take to develop counselling degrees? • Suggest practical steps for schools to improve their guidance and counselling programmes, such as specific training modules for counsellors or methods for better resource allocation. Suggested Recommendations 1. Policy and Supervision: The Ministry of Education should enforce guidelines for establishing and running guidance services, with regular supervision by inspectors and head teachers. 2. Training and Resources: Universities should offer specialised counselling degrees, and a professional counselling association should be established. Schools need adequate resources, including textbooks and trained personnel. 3. Programme Implementation: Schools should follow a structured curriculum that includes career guidance, educational guidance, and personal/social development. Regular evaluation and record-keeping of counselling sessions are essential for effective programme management. References The references provided are generally formatted in APA style, but there are a few	
--	---	--

BPI Review Form 070520

	corrections and improvements needed for consistency and accuracy. • Ensure all authors' names are formatted consistently (last name, first initial). • Include page numbers for book chapters or indicate "pp. xxx-xxx" if specific pages are cited. • Use italics for book titles, journal names, and conference proceedings. • Provide URLs for online sources and include retrieval dates if the content may change over time. Here's a revised version with proper formatting and some adjustments: REFERENCES American School Counselor Association. (2003). <i>The ASCA National Model: A framework for school counseling programs</i>. Alexandria, VA: Author. American School Counselor Association. (1998). <i>Ethical Standards for School Counselors</i>. Retrieved from http://www.schoolcounselor.org/content.asp?pl=325&sl=133&contentid=243 American School Counselor Association. (2005). <i>Continuing Education Requirements</i>. Retrieved from http://www.schoolcounselor.org/content.asp?pl=325&sl=133&contentid=243 Arredondo, P., Toporek, R., Brown, S. P., Jones, J., Locke, D., Sanchez, J., & Stadler, H. (1996). Operationalization of multicultural competencies. <i>Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development</i>, 24(1), 42-78. Baker, S. B., & Gerler, E. R. (2001). Counseling in Schools. In D. C. Locke, J. E. Myers, & E. L. Horn (Eds.), <i>The Handbook of Counseling</i> (pp. xxx-xxx). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications. Borders, L. D., & Drury, S. M. (1992). Comprehensive school counseling programs: A review for policy makers and practitioners. <i>Journal of Counseling and Development</i>, 70(4), 487-498. Brigman, G., & Campbell, C. (2003). Helping students improve academic achievement and school success behavior. <i>Professional School Counseling</i>, 7, 91-98. Chireshe, R. (2009). School Guidance and Counseling Services needs assessment in Zimbabwe secondary schools. 2nd International Conference of Education, Research, and Innovation. Madrid, Spain. Choge, J., Tanui, E., & Ndenga, L. (2011). Challenges facing Guidance Counseling Teachers in secondary schools in Kenya: A case of Nandi North District. Kabarak University First International Conference. College Board Advocacy & Policy Center. (2011). <i>School Counselors Literature and Landscape Review: The State of School Counseling in America</i>. Civic Enterprises.	
--	---	--

BPI Review Form 070520

Do you think that the references in the manuscript are proper, recent and sufficient? If you have any suggestions, please write here.	Based on the information provided earlier, the references in the manuscript appear to be somewhat adequate but may benefit from further scrutiny for appropriateness, currency, and sufficiency. Here are some observations: 1. Appropriateness: The references generally align with the topic of guidance and counseling in schools, covering areas such as program implementation, effectiveness, ethical standards, and multicultural competencies. However, there are a few references that seem tangential or outdated (e.g., references from the 1990s). 2. Currency: Some references are recent and relevant, such as those from the 2000s and 2010s, which include current practices and models in school counseling. However, there are also references from the 1990s and early 2000s that may not capture the most current trends or research in the field. 3. Sufficiency: The number of references seems appropriate for a study of this nature. However, ensuring that all key aspects of guidance and counseling in schools are covered by recent and relevant literature would enhance the comprehensiveness of the reference list.	
--	---	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Collins Matemba
Department, University & Country	Masinde Muliro University of Science and Technology, Kenya